

**ALAMEDA COUNTY PUBLIC WORKS AGENCY  
TREE ADVISORY BOARD MEETING**

Wednesday, March 21, 2007

Public Works Building, 951 Turner Court, Hayward  
Conference Room 230

**MINUTES**

**MEMBERS PRESENT:** Chair, Kathie Ready; Vice-Chair, Don Sheppard; Dee McDonough

**MEMBERS ABSENT:** Dan Gallagher and Donald G. Nelson

**STAFF PRESENT:** Inta Brainerd, Arborist; Steve Jones, Supervisor; Lupe Serrano, OPPD Adm.; and Angela Leddell, Clerk

**OTHERS PRESENT:** Anthony and Vivian Garde, respondents

**CALL TO ORDER:** The Chair called the meeting to order at 3:45 p.m. There were two people in the audience.

**I. ANNOUNCEMENT:**

- The next regularly scheduled Board meeting will be held on May 16, 2007.

**II. HEARINGS:**

**15811 Via Rivera, San Lorenzo** – *Continued from February 21, 2007 Meeting.*

Staff explained that in 2002 a Liquidambar tree had dropped several large limbs within the County right-of-way and recommended removal. County tree crews removed the tree and a County hired contractor removed the stump at no charge to the property owner. To this date the owner has not replaced the tree. Staff extended the permit expiration several times over the last four years and the owner has not yet complied with the provisions of the tree ordinance.

Chair, Kathie Ready asked property owner why he did not do as directed and plant the approved tree within the right-of-way.

Mr. Garde, property owner, said he would remove the Nandina and plant the tree approved by the County. Mr. Garde asked for clarification on where to plant the tree. Vice Chair, Don Sheppard advised property owner that he did not need to remove the Nandina planted in the middle of the yard but that he would need to plant a tree within the County road right-of-way.

**RECOMMENDATION:**

Moved by Vice-Chair, Don Sheppard; seconded by Ms. Dee McDonough, the Tree Advisory Board proposed a timeline and approved 14 days for property owner to plant an Amur Maple within the right-of-way. Motion carried 3/0/2 with Mr. Dan Gallagher and Mr. Donald G. Nelson excused.

**15794 Via Rivera, San Lorenzo – Continued from February 21, 2007 Meeting.**

Staff explained details of Mr. Garde's 2002 request. He requested permission to remove a Sycamore tree in front of the above address. – Request was denied. Staff determined the tree to be healthy, but indicated that it could be pruned away from the house. The property owner was mailed information and a tree permit application for pruning. In 2003, the County received another request for tree removal and information that the driveway had been lifted two inches. – Second request was denied. A denial letter including root barrier information was mailed to the property owner.

In conjunction with sidewalk repairs Mr. Garde again asked to be allowed to remove the Sycamore tree. Staff advised Mr. Garde that root pruning or bio-barrier root control could be used in conjunction with the repairs. – Again the request was denied.

Staff reported that she had made a site visit in November, 2006, and noticed that the Sycamore tree had been removed and that no permits were acquired and no replacement has been planted.

Chair Ready asked property owner why had the denial letters from the County went ignored and a healthy Sycamore tree removed.

Mr. Garde, property owner, introduced pictures of the Sycamore tree and the sidewalk. He pointed out a safety hazard with the raised driveway and possible damage to the ceiling caused by the tree. Discussion ensued between the Tree Advisory Board and Mr. Garde over the removal of the Sycamore tree.

**RECOMMENDATION:**

Ms. Dee McDonough made a motion to fine the owner \$2220.00 for the value of the tree, a \$500.00 fine for the removal, and require the owner to replace the tree with an approved 24 inch boxed tree. The motion was seconded by Vice-Chair, Don Sheppard. Total fine \$2720.00. Motion carried 3/0/2 with Mr. Dan Gallagher and Mr. Donald G. Nelson excused.

**III. WORK SESSION:**

- Date set for April 18, 2007, 3:00 p.m.

**IV: WRAP UP AND ADJOURN:**

- Meeting adjourned at 4:28 p.m.